AN OVERVIEW OF AMERICAN PUBLIC SCHOOL BANDS AND ORCHESTRAS BEFORE WORLD WAR II

Jere T. Humphreys Arizona State University Tempe, Arizona

It is not an exaggeration to characterize school bands and orchestras, along with the proverbial motherhood and apple pie, as symbols of much that is good and wholesome in American life. Instrumental music in the public schools has experienced tremendous growth during this century, and it continues to enjoy a "squeaky-clean" image and widespread popularity. The recent sesquicentennial of public school music education sparked interest in the historical roots of music education in this country. The purpose of this article is to outline the history of American school bands and orchestras prior to World the history of American school bands and orchestras prior to world

Nineteenth century roots

were usually taught by a teacher of another subject who happened to considered ad hoc, often meeting outside regular school hours, and receive official recognition from school administrators. They were nineteenth century, and where they did exist they generally did not riculum. School bands and orchestras existed only sporadically in the tion, instrumental music was slow to take its place in the school curprimary reason for instrumental music's belated entrance into the be an amateur musician. According to Edward Bailey Birge, the strumental associations, in favor of sacred music and its perceived school curriculum was a prejudice against secular music, with its inopportunity to hear high quality instrumental music. Other reasons inassociations with vocal music. This bias was exacerbated by a lack of teachers having been trained in the singing school tradition), and a lack of precedent either in this country or in Europe for instrumental included a dearth of trained instrumental teachers (most school music struction in the schools Compared to the relatively steady spread of vocal music instruc-

Gradually, the situation changed. After the founding of the New York Philharmonic in 1842, highly trained European immigrants ar-

Humphreys

rived to populate it and other professional orchestras. Around midcentury, European orchestras toured extensively our nation's cities, and in 1862, the well-known orchestra conductor Theodore Thomas, himself a German immigrant, formed his own orchestra. Thomas, an educator at heart, always programmed Beethoven interspersed with "lighter" music in an attempt to demonstrate the difference between music as art and music as entertainment.

These touring- and immigrant instrumentalists exposed city-dwellers to professional level instrumental music performances and teachers. Some of these musicians taught instrumental music, usually in music academies and homes.

The American band movement provided a greater impetus for public school instrumental music than did the orchestra. Three types of bands foreshadowed the public school band: military, town, and professional.

Earliest bands

Military bands became prevalent during the Revolutionary War. They typically consisted of six to eight players, mostly woodwinds. The United States Marine Corps Band was formed in 1798, followed by the West Point Band in 1815. Most American bands in the first quarter of the nineteenth century were military or quasi military organizations.²

During the late 1830's and 1840's, military brass bands surpassed in popularity the all-woodwind bands and bands with mixed instrumentation. Three technological advancements in instrument design and manufacture made possible the creation of all-brass bands: the keyed bugle (introduced in this country around 1815), three-valved cornets and trumpets (which largely replaced keyed bugles in the 1840's and 1950's), and the saxhorn (first patented in 1845). Since these instruments could produce all twelve tones, they replaced clarinets on the melody.

The Civil War provided further impetus to the nineteenth century band movement. Civil War military bands typically consisted of eight to twenty-four players including percussion. Frequently, an entire band would enlist in one of the armies as a unit.

American town brass bands began to appear during the second quarter of the nineteenth century. Two of the earliest well-known town bands were the Dodworth Brass Band of New York City, organized in 1834, and the Boston Brass Band, formed in 1835 by the virtuoso keyed bugle player Edward Kendall. As more and more town bands

were formed in the last half of the century brass band competitions became fairly common.³

Dozens of professional bands were formed in the United States in the second half of the nineteenth century. The "golden age of bands" was ushered in shortly after the Civil War by several famous bandmasters, the most important of whom was Patrick Sarsfield Gilmore, an Irish-American bandmaster and cornetist who had led several Massachusetts bands during the 1850's. In 1873, Gilmore was appointed conductor of what became the most famous band in the country, featuring such famous performers as trombonist Frederick N. Innes, saxophonist E.A. Lefebre, and cornetists Matthew Arbuckle, Jules Levy, and Herbert L. Clarke. Until his death in 1892, Gilmore led the band in more than one concert per day."

Gilmore's most important contributions to the American band movement were his successful efforts to standardize the concert band's instrumentation by repopularizing the woodwinds, his three highly publicized mammoth music festivals held in New Orleans (1864) and Boston (1869 and 1872), and his insistence upon the highest possible musical standards from his bands. He and his band served as models for dozens of other professional bandmasters and their bands, who in turn inspired the formation of thousands of school, college, municipal, and industrial bands in the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries. The most notable of the bandmasters inspired by Gilmore was John Philip Sousa, who, as conductor of his own band from 1892 to 1932, became the most famous bandmaster in the world.⁵

Early school programs

The first school instrumental music program on record began at Boston's Farm and Trades School in 1857.6 Several other programs are known to have existed in the second half of the nineteenth century. Although little is known about these early instrumental programs, 7 it is safe to say that they were not numerous, that students did not receive academic credit for participation, and that there were no standard teaching methods, instrumentation, or curricula. In many instances string students began their studies with private teachers, while band students started in school programs. Often, school ensembles were composed of both stringed and wind instruments, and bore little resemblance to either orchestras or bands. Some of these bands (sometimes called "kid" or "juvenile bands") emulated professional and community bands with uniforms, parades, and concerts.

Orchestras, not bands, were the first to win widespread popularity in the public schools. Some of the earliest high school orchestra pro-

grams organized on a permanent basis were in Chelsea, Massa-chusetts; Hartford, Connecticut; New Albany, Indiana; Sullivan, Indiana; and Oakland, California. One of the first schools to award academic credit for participation was in Richmond, Indiana, where Will Earhart directed an orchestra as early as 1898 for which students received credit for participating by 1905. The difficulty of maintaining desirable instrumentation in high school orchestras populated by students of private teachers led to the development of grade school orchestras which served as feeder programs for the high school ensembles. Some programs were successful in this regard, as evidenced by reports of Earhart's Richmond, Indiana orchestra having reached symphonic proportions by 1912.

From the beginning of the twentieth century through about 1920, orchestras were far more numerous than bands in the American schools. In fact, 1900–1920 can properly be called the heyday of American public school orchestras. As late as the 1919–1920 school year, a survey revealed that 278 of 359 cities sponsored school orchestras, while only 88 sponsored bands. In elementary instrumental programs of that era, string and wind players were often combined, just as in the nimeteenth century.

The rise of school orchestras and bands from 1900 to 1920 coincided with new programs in music theory and music appreciation, the latter facilitated by the introduction of first the player-piano, and later the phonograph. This expansion of the music curriculum was due in part to successful efforts by leaders of the new progressive education movement to expand the schools' offerings, and to rapidly increase high school enrollments. According to Birge, instrumental music's "entrance into the schools was due to inditions inherent in the growth of democracy in education, which developed an elective system giving the pupil a free choice of a wide range of studies." By the end of World War I, progressive education leaders viewed expanded music programs as an integral part of a new progressive American school system intended to be an "instrument of socialization," designed to help citizens take their places in the nation's emerging complex industrial society."

School systems began to provide more tangible support for instrumental music programs during the late 1910's and early 1920's. This support came in the form of instruments, equipment, rehearsal and storage space; uniforms, and, in some cases, rehearsal time during the school day and academic credit. During this period, full-time instrumental music teachers, especially orchestra directors, began to be employed. Full time teachers were a significant improvement over the practice of using part-time instructors, teachers of other subjects, and even students to direct ensembles, or of having the ensembles led

by music supervisors, most of whom were vocalists. For a long period of time, many of these instrumental specialists were former professional performers, but gradually teacher-training institutions began to furnish trained instrumental teachers.

strated the utility of violin class teaching. One of the music educators who visited England to observe the "Maidstone Movement" was which made the teaching of instrumental music more practical and Another significant development in the 1910's and 1920's was the widespread adoption of class instrumental teaching in the schools, of his own in 1912.13 His violin classes were added to the Boston Albert G. Mitchell, a music supervisor in Boston. Mitchell then orgathat was sponsored by an instrument manufacturing and music pubeducators observed a highly successful string program in England soil on the national landscape."12 Around 1910, some American music notes, these "isolated practices of class teaching did not find a fertile occurred throughout the nineteenth century, but, as James A. Keene teaching of instruments in classes, as opposed to private lessons, had undoubtedly contributed to the growth of orchestras and bands. The method books for other instruments appeared soon after Mitchell's the Music Supervisors National Conference (MSNC) in 1920.14 Class teaching was demonstrated for the first time at a national meeting of school schedule in 1914. The effectiveness of class instrumental nized violin classes in Boston in 1911, and wrote a class method book 1897 and eventually spread to more than 3,000 schools, demonlishing company. This program, which began in Maidstone, England in class method for violin.

Entering the modern era

The end of World War I marked the beginning of the modern era for public school instrumental music, especially for bands. Stirring band music and highly visible military bands had the associated with America's success in the war. After the war, bandmasters and band performers trained in military service became available to the schools in larger numbers. Reserve Officer Training Corps bands, formed in many high schools and colleges during the war, remained intact or were converted to regular school bands. As the country entered the "Roaring Twenties," American school band programs benefited from a booming economy, a population swelled by millions of new immigrants, a larger number of high school students, especially those from the rising middle class, and a greater availability of musical instruments.

Another factor contributing to the exploding school band movement was the fact that radio, the phonograph, motion pictures, the emergence of jazz, and automobiles were changing recreational patterns, re-

sulting in a lessening of interest in town and community bands. Town bands had long provided musical enjoyment and recreation for participants, entertainment for listeners, and had contributed to parades, ceremonies, and other town rituals. In the 1920's, school bands began to perform these functions, and, in doing so, replaced town bands in much the same way that public school vocal programs had assumed the functions of singing schools in the nineteenth century:18

The late 1910's also saw the beginning of a serious interest in instrumental music education on the part of professional organizations. Convention programs of the Music Teachers National Association, National Education Association, and MSNC had, for years, included sessions related to instrumental music, but around 1917–19 the topic took on increasing importance. An example of association support was the founding in 1922 of the MSNC Committee On Instrumental Affairs, a committee that came to play a very important role in the band and orchestra movement.

The decade of the 1920's saw phenomenal growth in school band programs. In contrast to the begir ning of the 1920's when orchestras dominated, by the end of the decade the vast majority of high schools, and many grade schools as well, were supporting bands. School orchestras appear to have grown steadily but somewhat less rapidly in number and size during this time.¹⁷

Band and orchestra contests

One of the major factors leading to the spectacular growth of instrumental programs after World War I was the contest movement. Beginning in the late 1910's, as an outgrowth of school music appreciation classes, the so-called music memory contest prolliferated. In addition, county-, district-, and state-level music contests for performing ensembles became more numerous.¹⁸

By the early 1920's, the decrease in the number of professional and town bands led to concern among manufacturers and dealers about instrument sales. Consequently, a Chicago-based music merchants' association and the Band Instrument Manufacturing Association sponsored a national band contest in Chicago in June 1923. The event was widely publicized. Invitations were mailed to hundreds of grammar school, high school, and military school bands. Only thirty bands actually competed; with one-half of them from the Chicago area. A high school band from Fostoria, Ohio, directed by John W. Wainwright, won first place in the high school division. 19

This contest, or tournament as it was called, was poorly run in many respects: there was considerable misleading precontest hype, there

Bands and Orchestras

Humphreys

was only one judge, there were no requirements for instrumentation or repertoire, the marching competition was cancelled, and the contest was held out-of-doors in less than ideal surroundings. Despite its shortcomings, however, this "national" contest generated such high levels of enthusiasm that subsequent contests were planned.²⁰

In an attempt to prevent contests from becoming overly commercialized, sponsorship was turned over to the National Bureau for the Advancement of Music (NBAM), a music advocacy organization sponsored by instrument manufacturers. Under the direction of the MSNC Committee on Instrumental Affairs, state and regional elimination contests were proposed, and repertoire lists were developed for both junior and senior high schools.²¹

An insufficient number of state and regional contests held in 1924 and 1925 were in compliance with the new rules, so no national contests was held in those years. One of the main problems was that the repertoire lists consisted of music too advanced for many of the bands, both in terms of technique and instrumentation. In 1926 enough states and regions complied with the rules that a national contest was held at Fostoria, Ohio. Of the thirteen competing bands, the Joliet Township High School Band of Joliet, Illinois, directed by A.R. McAllister, won first place; Fostoria, Ohio placed second; Ogden, Utah was third; and a band from Louisville, Kentucky placed fourth.²²

Also in 1926, the National School Band Association was formed to help administer future contests along with the NBAM and the MSNC. Its name was changed to the National School Band and Orchestra the National School Band and Orchestra Association in 1929. Subsequent national band contests were held in Council Bluffs, lowa in 1927 with twenty-three bands competing: Joliet, Illinois in 1928 with twenty-seven bands; Denver, Colorado in 1929 with twenty-six bands; Flint, Michigan in 1930 with forty-four bands; and Tulsa, Oklahoma in 1931 with forty-two bands.²⁴

The 1927 national band contest featured several changes: bands were divided for the first time into two classes, A and B, according to school enrollment; a double elimination requirement for the six best bands in Class A was added; and a sight-reading component was made compulsory. A national solo contest traes added to the band contest in 1928, and small ensemble events and a category for Class C bands began in 1930.²⁵

Also in 1928, points were subtracted for deficient instrumentation. Eventually, bandmasters Sousa, Clarke, Edwin Franko Goldman, Frederick A. Stock, and Taylor Branson were asked to formulate a standard instrumentation for concert bands. This group recommended a strong woodwind component in keeping with the traditions of the

Gilmore and Sousa bands. Their recommendation went against the British brass band tradition, as well as the American school band tendency at the time. Their recommended instrumentation has remained more or less standard to this day. 27

Orchestras followed closely upon the heels of bands. The first approved state-level orchestra contests were held in fifteen states in 1928,²⁸ followed by thirty states in 1929. The first national orchestra contest was held in 1929 in Mason City, lowa, followed by contests in Lincoln, Nebraska in 1930, and Cleveland, Ohio in 1931.²⁹

Several well-known musicians adjudicated the national band and orchestra contests from 1926 through 1931, including Sousa, Goldman, and Joseph E. Maddy. The 1931 band contest featured the seventy-seven-year-old Sousa as conductor for the massed band concert. Despite the popularity of the contests, however, they were becoming more and more competitive, so that by 1931 a strong movement arose to convert them to festivals. Many people believed that the practice of declaring only one winner in each category was destructive to all ensembles that failed to win first place. Adding to the resentment was the fact that Joliet, Illinois had won in Class A at the first three official national band contests (1926–28), and after a year of ineligibility in 1929, placed second in 1930 and recaptured first place in 1931. Similarly, Hobart, Indiana, directed by William D. Revelli, won in Class B in both 1930 and 1931. The fact that winners were decided by as little as four-tenths of a percentage poin, was also resented.³⁰

The controversy over contests versus festivals was resolved through a compromise: group ratings replaced individual rankings at the 1933 national band and orchestra contests. (No national contests were held in 1932 due to general dissatisfaction with the contest system and to the country's economic conditions). Eventually, a five-division system (I-V) was settled upon, the system in use today. Even the semantics were resolved with the acceptance of the term "competitive festivals" (or "competition-festivals"). 32

With a new name and revised rating plan, national band festivals were held in Evanston, Illinois in 1933 and Des Moines, Iowa in 1934. National orchestra festivals were held in Elmhurst, Illinois in 1933 and Ottawa, Kansas in 1934. After these two years, national band and orchestra festivals alternated years from 1935 through 1937, during which orchestra competitions were held in Madison, Wisconsin in 1935 and Columbus, Ohio in 1937, and a band festival was held in Cleveland, Ohio in 1936.

Due to the difficulty of finding suitable host cities and to the travel distances required for participants in the national festivals, a plan was

Bands and Orchestras

of students performed in regional band, orchestra, and vocal contests, of adjudicators. Three specialized organizations—the National School of Control," which set uniform contest policies, including the approval tional festivals. The regions were administered by a "National Board adopted in 1937 to sponsor ten annual regional festivals in lieu of nastate levels. The 1940 regional festivals, for example, included 436 and hundreds of thousands more participated at city, district, and in most regions in 1938.33 From 1938 through 1940, tens of thousands Band, Orchestra, and Vocal Associations—implemented the new plan bands (26,617 students) and 88 orchestras (13,468 students).34

Conclusions

that the American school system included thousands of one-teacher wars was nothing short of amazing, especially considering the fact chestras as late as the mid-1930's, although some states were beginthree teachers. Many of these small schools still had no bands or orelementary schools and a large number of high schools with one to bands and orchestras did exist, they often were forced, even in the ning to require music instruction (usually general music). Even where mid-1930's, to rehearse outside school hours or at noon.35 The growth of instrumental music in the schools between the world

and senior high schools indicated that an average of 69 percent of again in 1927 at a meeting of the National Association for School Superintendents in Dallas, Texas; the latter performance apparently performed at the MSNC conference in Detroit, Michigan in 1926, and chestras did become larger. The first national high school orchestra bands after World War I, but there is evidence that the existing orstudents in each program owned their own instruments, and that 20 tant body.36 In the late 1930's, a survey of 150 relatively large junior greatly enhanced the prestige of school orchestras among that impordoubtedly profited from radio broadcasts of professional orchestral education.37 Whereas bands benefited from a larger middle class string teachers were certified by their respective boards of percent of the students studied privately, although only 69 percent of performances such as those conducted by Walter Damrosch. Both school population, to which they appealed, school orchestras unbegan to appear in large numbers during the 1920's.39 edited music, and pedagogical treatises for young performers which types of groups were aided by the publication of class method books, The number of public school orchestras grew far less rapidly than

to draw upon a more extensive and higher at the type repertoire, a wider selection of appropriate pedagogical materials, many more trained music teachers, larger schools, a stronger national economy, and a By the beginning of World War II, instrumental programs were able

age of school instrumental performing ensembles. School orchestras and bands have intinued to grow, aided by social reforms such as the civil and women's rights movements. 99 School 1870 through Sousa's death in 1932, we are now living in the golden musical than ever before. Although the golden age of bands was from bands and orchestras are today more numerous, larger, and more fairly short but strong tradition for school instrumental programs

'Edward Bailey Birge, History of Public School Music in the United States (Bryn Mawr, National Conference, 1966), pp. 176-78. Pennsylvania: Oliver Ditson Company, 1928; reprinted by the Music Educators

²James A. Keene, A History of Music Education in the United States (Hanover, New Hampshire: University Press of New England, 1982), p. 283.

³Michael Mamminga, "Brittish Brass Bands," Music Educators Journal, 58:3 (November

*Jere T. Humphreys, "Strike Up the Band! The Legacy of Patrick S. Gilmore." Music Educators Journal, 74:2 (October 1987), 22-26.

This organization was called a band, although its instrumentation consisted of "tissue covered combs, three violins, and a bass viol;" see Keene, History of Music Education, p. 271.

'Ibid., pp. 270-86; Raoul Camus, "Bands," The New Grove Dictionary of American Schools," The New Grove Dictionary of American Music, vol. II. H. Wiley Hitchcock and Stanley Sadie, eds. (London: Macmillan Press Limited, 1986), p. 13. Press Limited, 1986), p. 134; and Richard Colwell, "Education in Music: Music, vol. I. H. Wiley Hitchcock and Stanley Sadie, eds. (London: Macmillan

Brige, History of Public School Music, pp. 180-85.

*Osbourne McConathy, Karl W. Gehrkens, and Edward B. Birge, Present Status of Music Instruction in Colleges and High Schools, 1919–1920, United States Bureau of Education, Bulletin no. 9 (Washing.on, D.C.: U.S. Bureau of Education, 1921), p.

¹⁰Birge, History of Public School Music, p. 178.

¹¹Jere T. Humphreys, "Applications of Science: The Age of Standardization and Effition, 9:1 (January 1988), 1-21. ciency in Music Education," The Bulletin of Historical Research in Music Educa-

¹²Keene, History of Music Education, p. 281.
¹³Albert Mitchell, The Class Method for the Violin, Book I (Boston: Oliver Ditson Company, 1912).

"Robin K. Deverich, "The Maidstone Movement-Influential British Precursor of Amertion, 35:1 (Spring 1987), 39-55. ican Public School Instrumental Classes," Journal of Research in Music Educa-

¹⁵Charles D. Whitehill, "Sociological Conditions Which Contributed to the Growth of the School Band Movement in the United States," *Journal of Research in Music* Education, 17:2 (Summer 1969), 180.

"Humphreys, "Strike Up the Band," p. 26.

"Samuel George Wagner, "The Status of the Orchestra in the Public High Schools of Allegheny County" (M.A. thesis, University of Pittsburgh, 1926), pp. 9-23

Bands and Orchestras

60

18Between-school competitions in subjects other than music were also common during to 1931" (Ph.D. dissertation, University of Michigan, 1968), pp. 11, 241-42. this period; see James E. Moore, "The National School Band Contests from 1926

¹⁹Emil A. Holz, "The Schools Band Contest of America (1923)," Journal of Research in Music Education, 10:1 (Spring 1962), 6, 9.

²¹ James E. Moore, "National School Band Contests Between 1926 and 1931," Journal of Research in Music Education, 20:2 (Summer 1972), 233-34.

²²Moore, "The National School Band Contests," [1968], pp. 55–56.
²³"The Development of School Music Competitions: A Brief Historical Sketch," *Year*book of the Music Educators National Conference, 1938 (Chicago: Music

²⁴Moore, "National School Band Contests," [1972], pp. 236-43 Educators National Conference, 1938), p. 429.

²⁸Moore, "National School Band Contests," [1972], p. 239.
²⁷Joseph E. Maddy, "The Battle of Band Instrumentation," Music Educators Journal, 44:1 (September-October 1957), 35.

28The National Music Camp at Interlochen, Michigan was also founded in 1928.

²⁹"The Development of School Music Competitions," p. 428.

³⁰Moore, "National School Band Contests," [1972], p. 241.

31Moore, "The National School Band Contests," [1968], p. 239.

32A. R. McAllister, "National School Band Association: Annual Report of the President," Yearbook of the Music Educators National Conference, 1937, (Chicago: Music

33" The Development of School Music Competitions," p. 430. Educators National Conference, 1937), p. 384.

34"The National School Music Competition-Festivals," Yearbook of the Music Educators National Conference, 1939–40 (Chicago: Music Educators National Conference,

35Edith M. Keller, "Report of the Committee on Rural School Music," Yearbook of the Conference, 1938), pp. 252-74. Music Educators National Conference, 1938 (Chicago: Music Educators National

38Edgar B. Gordon, "Early Days of Instrumental Music in the Schools: The Birth of School Bands and Orchestras," Music Educators Journal, 43:2 (November December 1956), 45; and Birge, History of Public School Music, pp. 297-300.

Music Educators National Conference, 1938), pp. 314-15. chestras," Yearbook of the Music Educators National Conference, 1938 (Chicago 37Henry Sopkin, "Report of the Committee on Junior and Senior High School Or

36Birge, History of Public School Music, pp. 200-201.

39 For example, it appears that the four winning bands at the 1926 national band contest won the Class B national band contest in 1929 (Moore, "National School Band 43-51), and that blacks were excluded from a band from Lansing, Michigan that were exclusively male (Moore, "The National School Band Contests," [1968], pp.

CRITIQUES

a review

Jon C. Mitchell Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania Carnegie Mellon University

Pennsylvania **Beaver Counties of** Milltowns of Lawrence and A Surviving Tradition in the Italian Wind Bands: Emma Scogna Rocco:

University Microfilms Order No. 8702020 Ph.D., University of Pittsburgh, 1986

THE STUDY

The purpose of Rocco's study was to examine the place and influence of the Italian wind band tradition in western Pennsylvania mill it also dealt with the Italian wind band tradition in the United States Although this thesis contains portions of descriptive research, it is centrated specifically on the emergence, development and survival o largely historical research. Italian bands in the towns of New Castle, Mahoningtown, and Aliquippa towns between 1890 and 1986. While the focus of her research con

bands in the aforementioned towns represent: The investigator proposed that the three surviving Italian winc

- a viable means of cultural identity and ethnic preservation of southern Italian immigrant musical and social behavior;
- 2) transferred musical traditions closely allied to the social and religious life of the Italian-American; and
- surviving traditions in urban industrial areas where the ties of ethnicity to social and/or religious identification are still strong forces in a given

In order to establish a link between the band tradition of southern Italy and that same tradition in the United States, the general history of Italy (particularly that of the southern provinces of Abruzzi, Lazio, and Campania) and Italian immigration patterns to the northeastern area