





Chiral Plasmas: from Cosmology to Technology Igor Shovkovy Arizona State University



Workshop on Recent Developments in Chiral Matter and Topology

December 6 ~ 9, 2018 National Taiwan University, Taipei, Taiwan



Chiral forms of matter

• Early Universe, e.g.,

[Boyarsky, Frohlich, Ruchayskiy, Phys.Rev.Lett. 108, 031301 (2012)]

• Heavy-ion collisions, e.g.,

[Kharzeev, Liao, Voloshin, Wang, Prog.Part.Nucl.Phys. 88, 1 (2016)]

• Super-dense matter in compact stars, e.g.,

[Yamamoto, Phys.Rev. D93, 065017 (2016)]

- Ultra-relativistic jets from black holes
- Superfluid ³He-A, e.g.,

[Volovik, JETP Lett. 105, 34 (2017)]

• Dirac/Weyl (semi-)metals, e.g.,

[Li et. al. Nature Phys. 12, 550 (2016)]

Credit: Brookhaven National Laborate



Anomalous chiral matter

- Matter made of chiral fermions may allow $n_{\rm L} \neq n_{\rm R}$
- The chiral charge $(n_{\rm R} n_{\rm L})$, unlike the electric charge $(n_{\rm R} + n_{\rm L})$, is **not** conserved

$$\frac{\partial (n_R + n_L)}{\partial t} + \vec{\nabla} \cdot \vec{j} = 0$$

$$\frac{\partial (n_{R} - n_{L})}{\partial t} + \vec{\nabla} \cdot \vec{j}_{5} = \frac{e^{2} \vec{E} \cdot \vec{B}}{2\pi^{2} c}$$

• The chiral anomaly can have *macroscopic* implications in chiral matter

Anomalous plasmas elsewhere

• Inverse magnetic cascade may produce seeds of helical magnetic fields in the early Universe

[Vilenkin, Phys. Rev. D22, 3080 (1980)], [Joyce & Shaposhnikov, astro-ph/9703005], [Giovannini & Shaposhnikov, hep-ph/9710234]



• Eigenmodes of long wavelength and fixed helicity grow:

 $\frac{dB_k}{dt} \propto \frac{ck}{\sigma} \Big(4\pi C_5 \mu_5 - ck \Big) B_k$

[Boyarsky et al., PRL **108**, 031301 (2012)], [Tashiro et al., PRD **86**, 105033 (2012)], [Manuel et al., PRD **92**, 074018 (2015)], [Hirono et al., PRD **92**, 125031 (2015)], [Buividovich et al., PRD **94**, 025009 (2016)], [Gorbar et al., PRD **94**, 103528 (2016)], etc.

• Strong helical magnetic field in compact stars?

[Ohnishi, Yamamoto, arXiv:1402.4760] [Yamamoto, Phys. Rev. D **93**, 065017 (2016)] [Dvornikov, J. Exp. Theor. Phys. **123** 967 (2016)]

• Perhaps, chirality flipping is too strong...

[Grabowska, Kaplan, Reddy, Phys. Rev. D 91, 085035 (2015)]

 B_{θ}, j_{θ}

 B_z, j_z



ANOMALOUS EFFECTS IN HIC

[Miransky & Shovkovy, Phys. Rep. **576**, 1 (2015)] [Kharzeev, Liao, Voloshin, Wang, Prog. Part. Nucl. Phys. **88**, 1 (2016)] [Hattori & Huang, Nucl. Sci. Tech. **28**, 26 (2017)]

5



Chiral Magnetic Effect ($\mu_5 \neq 0$)

• Dirac equation @ $\mathbf{B} \neq 0$ $\left[i\gamma^{0}\partial_{0} - i\vec{\gamma}\cdot\left(\vec{\nabla} + ie\vec{A}\right)\right]\Psi = 0$

Energy spectrum

$$E_n^{(3+1)}(p_3) = \pm \sqrt{2n|e||B|} + p_3^2$$

Spin polarized LLL ($s=\downarrow$):

- R-handed electrons $p_3 < 0$
- L-handed positrons p₃>0

Topological fluctuations could induce nonzero chiral charge ($\mu_5 \neq 0$)

$$\left\langle \vec{j} \right\rangle = \frac{e^2 \vec{B}}{2 \pi^2} \mu_5$$

[Fukushima, Kharzeev, Warringa, Phys. Rev. D 78, 074033 (2008)]





Correlations of same & opposite charge particles:

[Abelev et al. (STAR), PRL **103**, 251601 (2009)] [Abelev et al. (STAR), PRC **81**, 054908 (2010)] [Abelev et al. (ALICE), PRL **110**, 012301 (2013)] [Adamczyk et al. (STAR), PRC **88**, 064911 (2013)]

$\begin{cases} \langle \cos(\varphi_{\alpha}^{\pm} + \varphi_{\beta}^{\mp} - 2\Psi_{\rm RP}) \rangle \\ \langle \cos(\varphi_{\alpha}^{\pm} + \varphi_{\beta}^{\pm} - 2\Psi_{\rm RP}) \rangle \end{cases}$

LARGE BACKGROUND EFFECTS!

[Belmont & Nagle, PRC 96, 024901 (2017)], [ALICE Collaboration, Phys. Lett. B777, 151 (2018)]



Chiral Magnetic Wave

• Nonzero charge density (a) $B \neq 0 \rightarrow CMW$



[Gorbar, Miransky, Shovkovy, Phys. Rev. D 83, 085003 (2011)]

• Back-to-back electric currents, or quadrupole charge correlations (i.e., difference in elliptic flows of in π^+ and π^-)

$$\frac{dN_{\pm}}{d\phi} \approx \bar{N}_{\pm} [1 + 2v_2 \cos(2\phi) \mp A_{\pm} r \cos(2\phi)]$$



where A_{\pm} is the charge asymmetry

[Burnier, Kharzeev, Liao, Yee, Phys. Rev. Lett. 107 (2011) 052303]

ASJ CMW: Experimental evidence



[Adam et al. (ALICE), Phys. Rev. C 93, 044903 (2016)]

Higher harmonics of particle correlations indicate a possible strong background

BACKGROUND EFFECTS MAY DOMINATE OVER THE SIGNAL!

[CMS Collaboration, arXiv:1708.08901]

9



FRESH LOOK AT CHIRAL MAGNETIC WAVE

[Rybalka, Gorbar, Shovkovy, arXiv:1807.07608] [Shovkovy, Rybalka, Gorbar, arXiv:1811.10635]

10

December 7, 2018 Recent Developments in Chiral Matter and Topology, National Taiwan University, Taiwan



Fresh look at CMW

- Simple 1-flavor model (**k** || **B**): $k_0\delta n - kB\delta\sigma_B + i\frac{\tau}{3}k^2\delta n - \frac{1}{e}\sigma_E k\delta E_z = 0$ $k_0\delta n_5 - kB\delta\sigma_B^5 + i\frac{\tau}{3}k^2\delta n_5 - i\frac{e^2}{2\pi^2}B\delta E_z = 0$ $k\delta E_z + ie\delta n = 0$
- The dispersion of the CMW mode:

$$k_0^{(\pm)} = -i\frac{\sigma_E}{2} \pm i\frac{\sigma_E}{2}\sqrt{1 - \left(\frac{3eB}{\pi^2 T^2 \sigma_E}\right)^2 \left(k^2 + \frac{e^2 T^2}{3}\right) - i\frac{\tau}{3}k^2}$$

11

• This is a completely diffusive mode when $\frac{3eB}{\pi^2 T^2 \sigma_E} \sqrt{k^2 + \frac{e^2 T^2}{3}} < 1$ [Shovkovy, Rybalka, Gorbar, arXiv:1811.10635]



Naïve analysis ($\sigma_E \rightarrow 0$)

• If Gauss's law is ignored, the CMW is nondiffusive, i.e.,

$$k_0^{(\pm)} = \pm \frac{3eB}{2\pi^2 T^2} \sqrt{k^2 + \frac{e^2 T^2}{3}} - i\frac{\tau}{3}k^2$$
, when $\sigma_E \to 0$.

- In the limit $k \rightarrow 0$, there is only a small dissipation due to the charge diffusion
- The CMW is gapped when $\sigma_E \to 0$
- Nonzero gap is from the anomaly term $\propto \delta E_z$

$$-i\frac{e^2}{2\pi^2}B\delta E_z = -i\frac{e^2B}{2\pi^2}\left(\frac{-ie\delta n}{k}\right)$$



CMW in HIC

• Model with two light u- and d-quarks:

$$k_0 \delta n_f - \frac{eq_f Bk}{2\pi^2 \chi_{f,5}} \delta n_{f,5} + iD_f k^2 \delta n_f - \frac{1}{eq_f} \sigma_{E,f} k \delta E_z = 0$$

$$k_0 \delta n_{f,5} - \frac{eq_f Bk}{2\pi^2 \chi_f} \delta n_f + iD_f k^2 \delta n_{f,5} - i\frac{e^2 q_f^2}{2\pi^2} B \delta E_z = 0$$

$$k \delta E_z + ie \sum_f q_f \delta n_f = 0$$

where $f = u, d$, and $q_u = \frac{2}{3}, q_d = -\frac{1}{3}$

 χ_f , D_f and $\sigma_{E,f}$ are susceptibilities, diffusion coefficients and electrical conductivities for each quark flavor, respectively



Non-perturbative regime

Near-critical strongly coupled quark-gluon plasma

$$\sigma_{E} = \sum_{f} \sigma_{E,f} = c_{\sigma} C_{em}^{\ell} T$$

$$\chi_{f} = c_{\chi} \chi_{f}^{(SB)}$$

$$C_{em}^{\ell} = (5/9) 4\pi \alpha_{em} \approx 0.051$$

$$D_{f} = \frac{c_{D}}{2\pi T}$$

Lattice data [Aarts et. al., JHEP 1502, 186 (2015)]

	c_{σ}	c_{χ}	C _D
T=200 MeV	0.11	0.80	0.78
T=235 MeV	0.21	0.89	1.37
T=350 MeV	0.32	0.87	1.85



Results

Two sets of modes: $k_{0,n}^{(\pm)} = \pm E_n(k) - i\Gamma_n(k)$ CMW is completely diffusive at small *eB* & *k*:





Moderately strong B-field

[Shovkovy, Rybalka, Gorbar, arXiv:1811.10635]





Allowed range of wave vectors: (50 MeV) 100 MeV $\leq k \leq$ 600 MeV Wavelengths: 2 fm $\leq \lambda_k \leq$ 12 fm (24 fm)



Strong B-field

[Shovkovy, Rybalka, Gorbar, arXiv:1811.10635]



Even for such strong *B*-field, the CMW is strongly overdampled

Charge diffusion $iD_f k^2$ plays a big role $(k \ge \frac{2\pi}{R})$



Very strong B-field

[Shovkovy, Rybalka, Gorbar, arXiv:1811.10635]

18



The CMW may become a propagating mode only at extremely strong *B*-field, $eB \gtrsim (200 \text{ MeV})^2$

In realistic heavy-ion collisions, it is overdampled



Credits: Borisenko et al., Phys. Rev. Lett. 113, 027603 (2014)

DIRAC & WEYL MATERIALS



Low-energy Hamiltonian of a Dirac/Weyl material

 P

$$H = \int d^3 \mathbf{r} \, \overline{\psi} \Big[-i v_F \Big(\vec{\gamma} \cdot \vec{\mathbf{p}} \Big) - \Big(\vec{b} \cdot \vec{\gamma} \Big) \gamma^5 + b_0 \gamma^0 \gamma^5 \Big] \psi$$





Strain in Weyl materials

Strains in the low-energy effective Weyl Hamiltonian lacksquare

$$H = \int d^3 \mathbf{r} \,\overline{\psi} \Big[-i v_F \Big(\vec{\gamma} \cdot \vec{\mathbf{p}} \Big) - \Big(\vec{b} + \vec{A}_5 \Big) \cdot \vec{\gamma} \,\gamma^5 + \Big(b_0 + A_{5,0} \Big) \gamma^0 \gamma^5 \Big] \psi$$

where the chiral gauge fields are

$$A_{5,0} \propto b_0 |\vec{b}| \partial_{||} u_{||} \qquad [Cortijo, Ferreiros, Landsteiner, Vozmediano. PRL 115, 177202 (2015)]
[Pikulin, Chen, Franz, PRX 6, 041021 (2016)]
[Grushin, Venderbos, Vishwanath, Ilan, PRX 6, 041046 (2016)]
[Cortijo, Kharzeev, Landsteiner, Vozmediano, PRB 94, 241405 (2016)]
$$A_{5,||} \propto \alpha |\vec{b}|^2 \partial_{||} u_{||} + \beta \sum_i \partial_i u_i$$

eading to the pseudo-EM fields

$$\vec{B}_5 = \vec{\nabla} \times \vec{A}_5 \quad \text{and} \quad \vec{E}_5 = -\vec{\nabla} A_0 - \partial_t \vec{A}_5$$$$

^)

t 5



CONSISTENT CHIRAL KINETIC THEORY

[Gorbar, Miransky, Shovkovy, Sukhachov, Phys. Rev. Lett. **118**, 127601 (2017)] [Gorbar, Miransky, Shovkovy, Sukhachov, Phys. Rev. B **95**, 115202 (2017)]

22

December 7, 2018 Recent Developments in Chiral Matter and Topology, National Taiwan University, Taiwan



Chiral kinetic theory

• Kinetic equation: [Son and Yamamoto, Phys. Rev. D 87, 085016 (2013)] [Stephanov and Yin, Phys. Rev. Lett. 109, 162001 (2012)]

$$\frac{\partial f_{\lambda}}{\partial t} + \frac{\left[e\tilde{\mathbf{E}}_{\lambda} + \frac{e}{c}(\mathbf{v} \times \mathbf{B}_{\lambda}) + \frac{e^{2}}{c}(\tilde{\mathbf{E}}_{\lambda} \cdot \mathbf{B}_{\lambda})\Omega_{\lambda}\right] \cdot \nabla_{\mathbf{p}}f_{\lambda}}{1 + \frac{e}{c}(\mathbf{B}_{\lambda} \cdot \Omega_{\lambda})} \\ + \frac{\left[\mathbf{v} + e(\tilde{\mathbf{E}}_{\lambda} \times \Omega_{\lambda}) + \frac{e}{c}(\mathbf{v} \cdot \Omega_{\lambda})\mathbf{B}_{\lambda}\right] \cdot \nabla_{\mathbf{r}}f_{\lambda}}{1 + \frac{e}{c}(\mathbf{B}_{\lambda} \cdot \Omega_{\lambda})} = 0$$

where $\tilde{\mathbf{E}}_{\lambda} = \mathbf{E}_{\lambda} - (1/e) \nabla_{\mathbf{r}} \epsilon_{\mathbf{p}}$, $\mathbf{v} = \nabla_{\mathbf{p}} \epsilon_{\mathbf{p}}$, and

$$\epsilon_{\mathbf{p}} = v_F p \left[1 - \frac{c}{c} (\mathbf{B}_{\lambda} \cdot \mathbf{\Omega}_{\lambda}) \right]$$

and $\mathbf{\Omega}_{\lambda} = \lambda \hbar \frac{\hat{\mathbf{p}}}{2p^2}$ is the Berry curvature

SU Current and chiral anomaly

• The definitions of density and current are

$$\begin{split} \rho_{\lambda} &= e \int \frac{d^{3}p}{(2\pi\hbar)^{3}} \left[1 + \frac{e}{c} (\mathbf{B}_{\lambda} \cdot \mathbf{\Omega}_{\lambda}) \right] f_{\lambda}, \\ \mathbf{j}_{\lambda} &= e \int \frac{d^{3}p}{(2\pi\hbar)^{3}} \left[\mathbf{v} + \frac{e}{c} (\mathbf{v} \cdot \mathbf{\Omega}_{\lambda}) \mathbf{B}_{\lambda} + e(\tilde{\mathbf{E}}_{\lambda} \times \mathbf{\Omega}_{\lambda}) \right] f_{\lambda} \\ &+ e \mathbf{\nabla} \times \int \frac{d^{3}p}{(2\pi\hbar)^{3}} f_{\lambda} \epsilon_{\mathbf{p}} \mathbf{\Omega}_{\lambda}, \end{split}$$

They satisfy the following anomalous relations:

$$\frac{\partial \rho_5}{\partial t} + \boldsymbol{\nabla} \cdot \mathbf{j}_5 = \frac{e^3}{2\pi^2 \hbar^2 c} \Big[(\mathbf{E} \cdot \mathbf{B}) + (\mathbf{E}_5 \cdot \mathbf{B}_5) \Big]$$

$$\frac{\partial \rho}{\partial t} + \boldsymbol{\nabla} \cdot \mathbf{j} = \frac{e^3}{2\pi^2 \hbar^2 c} \Big[(\mathbf{E} \cdot \mathbf{B}_5) + (\mathbf{E}_5 \cdot \mathbf{B}) \Big]$$

24

ASJ Consistent definition of current

• Bardeen-Zumino (Chern-Simons) term is needed,

$$\delta j^{\mu} = \frac{e^3}{4\pi^2 \hbar^2 c} \epsilon^{\mu\nu\rho\lambda} A^5_{\nu} F_{\rho\lambda}$$

[Gorbar, Miransky, Shovkovy, Sukhachov, PRL 118, 127601 (2017)]

$$\delta \rho = -\frac{e^3}{2\pi^2 \hbar^2 c^2} (\mathbf{b} \cdot \mathbf{B})$$

$$\delta \mathbf{j} = -\frac{e^3}{2\pi^2 \hbar^2 c} b_0 \mathbf{B} + \frac{e^3}{2\pi^2 \hbar^2 c} [\mathbf{b} \times \mathbf{E}]$$

[Gorbar, Miransky, Shovkovy, Sukhachov, PRB 96, 085130 (2017)]

μ

• Its role and implications:

or

- Electric charge is conserved ($\partial_{\mu} J^{\mu} = 0$)
- Anomalous Hall effect is reproduced

- CME vanishes in equilibrium ($\mu_5 = -eb_0$)



CHIRAL MAGNETIC PLASMONS

[Gorbar, Miransky, Shovkovy, Sukhachov, Phys. Rev. Lett. **118**, 127601 (2017)] [Gorbar, Miransky, Shovkovy, Sukhachov, Phys. Rev. B **95**, 115202 (2017)]

December 7, 2018 Recent Developments in Chiral Matter and Topology, National Taiwan University, Taiwan 26

Chiral magnetic plasmons

Non-degenerate plasmon frequencies @ k=0:

$$\omega_l = \Omega_e, \qquad \omega_{\rm tr}^{\pm} = \Omega_e \sqrt{1 \pm \frac{\delta \Omega_e}{\Omega_e}}$$

where the Langmuir frequency is

$$\Omega_e \equiv \sqrt{\frac{4\alpha}{3\pi\hbar^2}} \left(\mu^2 + \mu_5^2 + \frac{\pi^2 T^2}{3}\right)$$

and
$$\delta\Omega_{e} = \frac{2e\alpha v_{F}}{3\pi c\hbar^{2}} \left\{ 9\hbar^{2}b_{\perp}^{2} + \left[\frac{2v_{F}}{\Omega_{e}^{2}}(B_{0}\mu + B_{0,5}\mu_{5}) - 3\hbar b_{\parallel} - \frac{v_{F}\hbar^{2}}{4T}\sum_{\lambda=\pm}B_{0,\lambda}F\left(\frac{\mu_{\lambda}}{T}\right)\right]^{2} \right\}^{1/2}$$

[Gorbar, Miransky, Shovkovy, Sukhachov, Phys. Rev. Lett. **118**, 127601 (2017)] [Gorbar, Miransky, Shovkovy, Sukhachov, Phys. Rev. B **95**, 115202 (2017)]

27



[Gorbar, Miransky, Shovkovy, Sukhachov, Phys. Rev. Lett. 118, 127601 (2017)]



[Gorbar, Miransky, Shovkovy, Sukhachov, Phys. Rev. Lett. 118, 127601 (2017)]



ELECTRON TRANSPORT IN HYDRODYNAMIC REGIME

30

EVAL Hydrodynamics in Weyl metals The Euler equation for electron fluid: [Gurzhi, JETP 17, 521 (1963)] $\frac{1}{v_F}\partial_t \left(\frac{\epsilon + P}{v_F}\mathbf{u} + \sigma^{(\epsilon,B)}\mathbf{B}\right) = -en\left(\mathbf{E} + \frac{1}{c}[\mathbf{u} \times \mathbf{B}]\right) + \frac{\sigma^{(B)}(\mathbf{E} \cdot \mathbf{B})}{3v_F^2}\mathbf{u} - \frac{\epsilon + P}{\tau v_F^2}\mathbf{u} + O(\nabla_{\mathbf{r}})$ [Gorbar, Miransky, Shovkovy, Sukhachov, PRB 97, 121105(R) (2018)]

The energy conservation

$$\partial_t \epsilon = -\mathbf{E} \cdot (en\mathbf{u} - \sigma^{(B)}\mathbf{B}) + O(\nabla_{\mathbf{r}})$$

+ Maxwell equations with the Chern-Simons currents

$$\rho_{\rm CS} = -\frac{e^3 (\mathbf{b} \cdot \mathbf{B})}{2\pi^2 \hbar^2 c^2}$$
$$\mathbf{J}_{\rm CS} = -\frac{e^3 b_0 \mathbf{B}}{2\pi^2 \hbar^2 c} + \frac{e^3 [\mathbf{b} \times \mathbf{E}]}{2\pi^2 \hbar^2 c}$$

Experimental evidence in tungsten diphosphide (WP₂)

[Gooth et al., Nature Commun. 9, 4093 (2018)]



Rich spectrum of hydro modes

• Magneto-acoustic wave ($\rho = 0$):

$$\omega_{\mathrm{s},\pm} = -\frac{i}{2\tau} \pm \frac{i}{2\tau} \sqrt{1 - 4\tau^2 v_F^2} \frac{|\mathbf{k}|^2 w_0 - \sigma^{(\epsilon,u)} \left[2|\mathbf{k}|^2 B_0^2 - (\mathbf{k} \cdot \mathbf{B}_0)\right]}{3w_0}$$

• *Gapped* chiral magnetic wave ($\rho = 0$):

$$\omega_{\rm gCMW,\pm} = \pm \frac{eB_0\sqrt{3v_F^3 \left(4\pi e^2 T_0^2 + 3\varepsilon_e\hbar^3 v_F^3 k_{\parallel}^2\right)}}{2\pi^2 T_0^2 c\sqrt{\varepsilon_e\hbar}}$$

- Helicons $(\rho \neq 0)$: $\omega_{h,\pm} \approx \mp \frac{ck_{\parallel}^2 B_0}{4\pi\mu_m \rho_0} - \frac{i}{\tau} \frac{c^2 k_{\parallel}^2 w_0}{4\pi\mu_m v_F^2 \rho_0^2} + O(k_{\parallel}^3)$
 - New anomalous Hall waves at $\vec{b} \neq 0$, etc.

[Sukhachov, Gorbar, Shovkovy, Miransky, J. Phys. Cond. Matt. 30, 275601 (2018)]

ASJ Some lessons (for high energy)

- Propagating (not overdamped) hydrodynamic modes in relativistic charged chiral plasma are
 - Sound and Alfven waves @ high temperature
 - Plasmons and helicons @ high density
- Dynamical electromagnetism plays a crucial role
 - Electrical conductivity leads to screening of charge fluctuations
 - Dynamical anomalous production of chirality plays a big role
 - Charge diffusion is substantial, unless $k \rightarrow 0$
- Chiral magnetic waves are strongly overdamped in near-critical quark-gluon plasma created in heavy-ion collisions [Shovkovy, Rybalka, Gorbar, arXiv:1811.10635]



- Anomalous *macroscopic* effects are expected in many forms of chiral plasmas
- Experimental search for anomalous signatures in high-energy physics is *extremely difficult*
- Low-energy *chiral fermions* can be realized in Dirac/Weyl materials
- Fundamental anomalous physics could be tested in *table-top experiments*
- Non-dissipative anomalous effects could be valuable in *applied* research