Topological metals



Anton Burkov





Online Theoretical Physics Colloquium, April 29, 2020

• Liquid of interacting bosons, e.g. liquid helium.

$$\epsilon(\mathbf{k}) = \frac{\hbar^2 \mathbf{k}^2}{2m} - \mu$$

 Chemical potential is large and negative at high T, thus all bosons have high energy relative to it, no low energy excitations.



• Transition to superfluid at low T.



• Excitations are phonons with a gapless linear dispersion.



The origin of phonons is spontaneous symmetry breaking.

 $\langle \phi(\mathbf{r},t) \rangle = \langle \sqrt{\rho} e^{i\theta(\mathbf{r},t)} \rangle \neq 0$



Gapless excitations in crystals



Crystal breaks translational symmetry of space, has gapless acoustic phonons.

- Lesson I: gapless excitations do not arise accidentally, there must be a reason.
- Lesson 2: their existence is associated with interesting physics, such as superfluidity, crystallinity, etc.





Gapless fermions

 Energy spectrum of electrons in solids has form of bands separated by bandgaps.

Electrons obey Pauli principle.

Number of states in a band is always 2 times the number of unit cells.

Gapless fermions

• Even integer number of electrons per unit cell: insulator, no gapless excitations.



Gapless fermions

 Fractional (not even integer) number of electrons per unit cell: metal, Fermi surface of gapless excitations.



Metals









• Metals are fun and useful.

Insulators



• Insulators are boring.

- Recent understanding: gapless excitations may also appear for topological reasons.
- Insulators are not as boring as one might have thought: there are two distinct classes of insulators, not adiabatically connected to each other.

The Nobel Prize in Physics 2016



© Trinity Hall, Cambridge University. Photo: Kiloran Howard David J. Thouless Prize share: 1/2



F. Duncan M.

Prize share: 1/4

Haldane



Ill: N. Elmehed. © Nobel Media 2016 J. Michael Kosterlitz Prize share: 1/4

The Nobel Prize in Physics 2016 was divided, one half awarded to David J. Thouless, the other half jointly to F. Duncan M. Haldane and J. Michael Kosterlitz *"for theoretical discoveries of topological phase transitions and topological phases of matter"*.

Topological insulators

Transition between a topological and an ordinary insulator is only possible through closing the gap, which leads to gapless surface states on topological insulators.



Bulk topological metals

• Can bulk 3D metals be topologically nontrivial in the same sense?

Bulk topological metals

• Can bulk 3D metals be topologically nontrivial in the same sense?

 Can we have a bulk 3D topologically-protected metal when the material should be an insulator by band filling?

Accidental semimetal



Bands can overlap: materials with even number of electrons per unit cell often fail to be insulators.

Weyl semimetal

 Weyl semimetal: gapless topological phase which arises in 3D materials lacking time-reversal or inversion symmetries.



Murakami, 2007

Wan et al., 2011

AAB & Balents, 2011

Exists unaviodably as an intermediate phase between a topological and ordinary insulator in 3D.



Thin film of 3D TI: gapless Dirac surface states protected by TRS

Quantum Anomalous Hall Insulator



Break TRS by doping with magnetic impurities, or can use a magnetic TI.

Quantum Anomalous Hall Insulator

$$\sigma_{xy}^T = \frac{e^2}{2h}$$



$$\sigma_{xy} = \sigma_{xy}^T + \sigma_{xy}^B = \frac{e^2}{h}$$

Quantum Anomalous Hall Insulator



Haldane, 1988 Yu et al., 2010 Chang et al., 2013



From 2D QAH insulator to 3D Weyl semimetal

• Stack of 2D QAH insulators, separated by ordinary insulator spacers.



3D Integer Quantum Hall Effect



$$\sigma_{xy} = \frac{e^2}{h} \frac{G}{2\pi}$$
$$G = \frac{2\pi}{d}$$

Kohmoto, Halperin, Wu

 Hall conductivity involves a wavevector, transition to zero must happen smoothly.

3D Integer Quantum Hall Effect



 Hall conductivity is proportional to the distance between the nodes and varies smoothly.

3D Integer Quantum Hall Effect





 Hall conductivity is proportional to the distance between the nodes and varies smoothly.

"Plateau transition" in 3D



 Plateau transition is sharp in 2D, but broadens into Weyl semimetal phase in 3D.



 Hall conductivity is a derivative of the Luttinger volume with respect to the magnetic field.

• "Fractional" Hall conductivity in the absence of a Fermi surface inevitably implies Weyl nodes.

 Extra Landau level below the Fermi energy in between the Weyl nodes.

$$\sigma_{xy} = e \frac{\partial n}{\partial B} = e \frac{K}{2\pi\hbar} \frac{\partial}{\partial B} \frac{1}{2\pi\ell_B^2} = \frac{e^2}{h} \frac{K}{2\pi}$$



• Left-handed and right-handed charges should be separately conserved.



 Conservation is violated in the presence of collinear electric and magnetic fields.

$$\frac{\partial n_R}{\partial t} = \frac{1}{4\pi^2} \mathbf{E} \cdot \mathbf{B}$$

$$\frac{\partial n_L}{\partial t} = -\frac{1}{4\pi^2} \mathbf{E} \cdot \mathbf{B}$$



Density response in an ordinary metal

$$\frac{\partial n}{\partial t} = D\boldsymbol{\nabla}^2(n+gV)$$

Diffusion and drift current: $\mathbf{j} = eD \nabla n + egD \nabla V = eD \nabla n + \sigma \mathbf{E}$

• Einstein relation:
$$\sigma = e^2 g D$$

Density response in a Weyl metal

Total charge: $n = n_R + n_L$

Chiral charge: $n_c = n_R - n_L$

 If both were conserved, both would obey independent continuity (diffusion) equations:

$$\frac{\partial n}{\partial t} = D\nabla^2 n \qquad \qquad \frac{\partial n_c}{\partial t} = D\nabla^2 n_c - \frac{n_c}{\tau_c}$$
Density response in topological metal

$$\frac{\partial n}{\partial t} = D \nabla^2 (n + gV) + \mathbf{\Gamma} \cdot \nabla (n_c + gV_c)$$

$$\frac{\partial n_c}{\partial t} = D \nabla^2 (n_c + g V_c) - \frac{n_c + g V_c}{\tau_c} + \mathbf{\Gamma} \cdot \nabla (n + g V)$$

• New transport coefficients:

$$n = n_R + n_L$$

$$n_c = n_R - n_L$$

$$\Gamma = \frac{e\mathbf{B}}{2\pi^2 g}$$

Chiral charge relaxation time:

$$au_c \gg au$$

Density response in topological metal

$$\begin{aligned} \frac{\partial n}{\partial t} &= D \boldsymbol{\nabla}^2 (n + gV) + \boldsymbol{\Gamma} \cdot \boldsymbol{\nabla} (n_c + gV_c) \\ \frac{\partial n_c}{\partial t} &= D \boldsymbol{\nabla}^2 (n_c + gV_c) - \frac{n_c + gV_c}{\tau_c} + \boldsymbol{\Gamma} \cdot \boldsymbol{\nabla} (n + gV) \end{aligned}$$

• First derivatives will dominate at long length scales. This leads to propagating density modes and quasiballistic conductance.

Diffusion propagator

$$\mathcal{D}^{-1}(q,\omega) = \begin{pmatrix} -i\omega\tau + Dq^2\tau & -i\Gamma q\tau \\ -i\Gamma q\tau & -i\omega\tau + \tau/\tau_c + Dq^2\tau \end{pmatrix}$$

 Poles of the diffusion propagator determine the longdistance, long-time dynamics of the system.

Diffusion eigenmodes

$$\begin{split} &i\omega_{\pm} = Dq^2 + \frac{1}{2\tau_c} \pm \sqrt{\frac{1}{4\tau_c^2} - \Gamma^2 q^2} \\ &q < \frac{1}{2\Gamma\tau_c} \end{split}$$

 Ordinary diffusion of conserved electric and almost conserved chiral charges:

$$i\omega_+ = Dq^2 + \frac{1}{\tau_c}$$

$$i\omega_{-} = Dq^2$$

Diffusion eigenmodes

$$\begin{split} i\omega_{\pm} &= Dq^2 + \frac{1}{2\tau_c} \pm \sqrt{\frac{1}{4\tau_c^2} - \Gamma^2 q^2} \\ q &> \frac{1}{2\Gamma\tau_c} \end{split}$$

Get a propagating mode:

$$\omega \approx \Gamma q - iDq^2$$

Propagating mode

Get a propagating mode:

$$\omega \approx \Gamma q - iDq^2$$

This mode is weakly damped as long as:

 $)^{2}$

$$q < \frac{\Gamma}{D} = \frac{1}{L_a} \qquad \qquad L_a = \frac{D}{\Gamma} \sim \ell(k_F \ell_B)$$
$$\ell_B = \sqrt{\hbar c/eB}$$

Propagating mode

• Linearly-dispersing propagating mode:

$$\omega = \Gamma q$$

Exists as long as:

$$\frac{1}{L_*} < q < \frac{1}{L_a}$$

$$L_* = \frac{L_c^2}{L_a} \qquad \qquad L_c = \sqrt{D\tau_c} \qquad \text{chiral charge diffusion length}$$

• The existence of such a propagating mode in the diffusive transport regime in weak magnetic fields is a qualitatively new feature of topological metals.

Propagating modes

First time and first space derivative: wave equation rather than diffusion.

$$\frac{\partial n}{\partial t} = \Gamma \frac{\partial n_c}{\partial z} \qquad \qquad \frac{\partial n_c}{\partial t} = \Gamma \frac{\partial n}{\partial z}$$

$$n_R = \frac{1}{2}(n+n_c)$$
 $n_L = \frac{1}{2}(n-n_c)$

$$\frac{\partial n_R}{\partial t} = \Gamma \frac{\partial n_R}{\partial z} \qquad \qquad \frac{\partial n_L}{\partial t} = -\Gamma \frac{\partial n_L}{\partial z}$$

A pair of propagating chiral density modes.

Chiral Magnetic Effect

$$\mathbf{j} = rac{\sigma}{e} \mathbf{\nabla} \mu + eg\mu_c \mathbf{\Gamma}$$
 Kharzeev et al.

$$\sigma = \frac{ne^2\tau}{m}$$
 involves irreversible randomization of momentum, dissipative.

• Second term is nondissipative.

Chiral Magnetic Effect

$$\mathbf{j} = rac{\sigma}{e} \mathbf{\nabla} \mu + eg\mu_c \mathbf{\Gamma}$$
 Kharzeev et al.

• Second term is nondissipative.

$$\mathbf{j} = -\frac{c}{4\pi\lambda^2}\mathbf{A}$$

Anisotropic MR



Kharzeev et al.

• Chiral magnetic effect:

$$\mathbf{j} = \frac{\sigma}{e} \boldsymbol{\nabla} \boldsymbol{\mu} + e g \boldsymbol{\mu}_c \boldsymbol{\Gamma}$$

$$\rho_{xx} = \rho_{\perp} - \Delta \rho \cos^2 \theta, \qquad \Delta \rho = \rho_{\perp} - \rho_{\parallel}$$
$$\rho_{yx} = -\Delta \rho \sin \theta \cos \theta, \qquad \rho_{\perp} = 1/\sigma$$

Anisotropic MR

Negative LMR: $\rho_{xx} = \rho_{\perp} - \Delta \rho \cos^2 \theta$

Son & Spivak AAB

Planar Hall Effect: $\rho_{yx} = -\Delta \rho \sin \theta \cos \theta$

AAB
$$\Delta \rho = \rho_{\perp} - \rho_{\parallel} = \frac{1}{\sigma} \frac{(L_c/L_a)^2}{1 + (L_c/L_a)^2}$$

$$L_a = \frac{D}{\Gamma} \sim \ell (k_F \ell_B)^2$$

 $\ell_B = \sqrt{\hbar c/eB}$

purely quantum phenomena!

Anisotropic MR

$$\Delta \rho = \rho_{\perp} - \rho_{\parallel} = \frac{1}{\sigma} \frac{(L_c/L_a)^2}{1 + (L_c/L_a)^2}$$

• AMR has opposite sign to what is typically seen in ferromagnets and much larger magnitude.

 $\frac{\Delta\rho}{\rho_{\perp}}\approx 50\% \qquad {\rm largest\,AMR\ in\ a\ FM\ metal\ in\ U_3As_4}$

• Several hundred percent in Na₃Bi, N.P. Ong et al.

$$\frac{\Delta\rho}{\rho_{\parallel}} = \frac{(L_c/L_a)^4}{1 + (L_c/L_a)^2}$$

Optical conductivity

• From charge continuity equation:

$$\sigma_{zz}(\omega) = \lim_{q \to 0} \frac{ie^2\omega}{q^2} \chi_{00}(q,\omega)$$

$$\operatorname{Re}\sigma_{zz}(\omega) = \frac{\sigma}{1+\omega^{2}\tau^{2}} \left[1 + \left(\frac{L_{c}}{L_{a}}\right)^{2} \frac{1-\omega^{2}\tau\tau_{c}}{1+\omega^{2}\tau_{c}^{2}} \right]$$



AAB

Optical conductivity

• Transfer of spectral weight to a narrow low-frequency peak.

$$\operatorname{Re}\sigma_{zz}(\omega) = \frac{\sigma}{1+\omega^{2}\tau^{2}} \left[1 + \left(\frac{L_{c}}{L_{a}}\right)^{2} \frac{1-\omega^{2}\tau\tau_{c}}{1+\omega^{2}\tau_{c}^{2}} \right]$$

• Drude weight is preserved.

$$\int_0^\infty d\omega \operatorname{Re}\sigma(\omega) = \frac{\pi\sigma}{2\tau}$$



Optical conductivity

Probing charge pumping and relaxation of the chiral anomaly in a Dirac semimetal

Bing Cheng,¹ Timo Schumann,² Susanne Stemmer,² and N. P. Armitage^{1,*}

¹Department of Physics and Astronomy, The Johns Hopkins University, Baltimore, Maryland 21218, USA

²Materials Department, University of California, Santa Barbara, California 93106-5050, USA

(Dated: October 31, 2019)



Chiral anomaly and interactions

• Chiral anomaly inevitably implies Weyl nodes in case of weak interactions.

- Does this remain true when the interactions are not weak?
- In other words, can we gap out the Weyl nodes while preserving the chiral anomaly and while not breaking any symmetries?

3D Fractional Quantum Hall Effect

PHYSICAL REVIEW LETTERS 124, 096603 (2020)

Fractional Quantum Hall Effect in Weyl Semimetals

Chong Wang[®],¹ L. Gioia,^{2,1} and A. A. Burkov² ¹Perimeter Institute for Theoretical Physics, Waterloo, Ontario N2L 2Y5, Canada ²Department of Physics and Astronomy, University of Waterloo, Waterloo, Ontario N2L 3G1, Canada

(Received 8 July 2019; accepted 11 February 2020; published 6 March 2020)

We can "defeat" the anomaly, but at the cost of fractionalizing electrons.

3D Fractional Quantum Hall Effect

PHYSICAL REVIEW LETTERS 124, 096603 (2020)

Fractional Quantum Hall Effect in Weyl Semimetals

Chong Wang[®],¹ L. Gioia,^{2,1} and A. A. Burkov² ¹Perimeter Institute for Theoretical Physics, Waterloo, Ontario N2L 2Y5, Canada ²Department of Physics and Astronomy, University of Waterloo, Waterloo, Ontario N2L 3G1, Canada

(Received 8 July 2019; accepted 11 February 2020; published 6 March 2020)

- We can "defeat" the anomaly, but at the cost of fractionalizing electrons.
- This is analogous to asking if we can have a gapped Mott insulator not breaking any symmetries at odd integer electron filling per unit cell.

Vortex condensation

Induce fully gapped superconductivity in Weyl semimetal.

• Destroy SC coherence by condensing vortices while keeping the pairing gap: this produces an insulator.

• Chiral anomaly places strong restrictions on the procedure and prohibits a simple insulator, has to have topological order.

Weyl superconductor

• BCS: pairing k and -k states, i.e. internodal pairing.



Weyl superconductor

• FFLO: pairing states on the opposite side of each Weyl point, i.e. intranodal pairing.



BCS pairing

 BCS pairing can not open a gap, since the two chiralities are not mixed by the pairing term:

$$H = v_F \sum_{\mathbf{k}} c_{\mathbf{k}}^{\dagger} \tau^z \boldsymbol{\sigma} \cdot \mathbf{k} c_{\mathbf{k}} + \Delta \sum_{\mathbf{k}} (c_{\mathbf{k}R}^{\dagger} i \sigma^y c_{-\mathbf{k}L}^{\dagger} + h.c.)$$

$$\psi_{\mathbf{k}} = (c_{\mathbf{k}R\uparrow}, c_{\mathbf{k}R\downarrow}, c^{\dagger}_{-\mathbf{k}L\downarrow}, -c^{\dagger}_{-\mathbf{k}L\uparrow})$$

$$H = \sum_{\mathbf{k}} \psi_{\mathbf{k}}^{\dagger} (v_F \boldsymbol{\sigma} \cdot \mathbf{k} + \Delta \tau^x) \psi_{\mathbf{k}}$$

Meng & Balents

FFLO pairing

• FFLO does open a gap, but breaks translational symmetry:

$$H = v_F \sum_{\mathbf{k}} c_{\mathbf{k}}^{\dagger} \boldsymbol{\sigma} \cdot \mathbf{k} c_{\mathbf{k}} + \Delta \sum_{\mathbf{k}} (c_{\mathbf{k}\uparrow}^{\dagger} c_{-\mathbf{k}\downarrow}^{\dagger} + c_{-\mathbf{k}\downarrow} c_{\mathbf{k}\uparrow})$$

$$\psi_{\mathbf{k}} = (c_{\mathbf{k}\uparrow}, c_{\mathbf{k}\downarrow}, c^{\dagger}_{-\mathbf{k}\downarrow}, -c^{\dagger}_{-\mathbf{k}\uparrow})$$

$$H = \frac{1}{2} \sum_{\mathbf{k}} \psi_{\mathbf{k}}^{\dagger} (v_F \tau^z \boldsymbol{\sigma} \cdot \mathbf{k} + \Delta \tau^x) \psi_{\mathbf{k}}$$

FFLO pairing

FFLO does open a gap, but breaks translational symmetry:



 $\Delta(\mathbf{Q}) \sim \sum_{\mathbf{k}} \langle c^{\dagger}_{\mathbf{Q}+\mathbf{k}} c^{\dagger}_{\mathbf{Q}-\mathbf{k}} \rangle$

carries momentum 2Q.

 $\varrho(\mathbf{Q})\sim\Delta^*(-\mathbf{Q})\Delta(\mathbf{Q})$ carries momentum 4Q.

FFLO pairing



 $\varrho(\mathbf{Q}) \sim \Delta^*(-\mathbf{Q})\Delta(\mathbf{Q})$

carries momentum 4Q.

- This breaks translational symmetry, unless Q = G/4
- In other words, FFLO does not break translational symmetry when Weyl node separation is exactly half the BZ size.



• Fermi arc becomes Majorana arc, which occupies twice the momentum interval of the Fermi arc, i.e. 4Q.



$$\kappa_{xy} = \sigma_{xy} \left(\frac{\pi^2 k_B^2 T}{3}\right) = \frac{1}{4\pi} \left(\frac{\pi^2 k_B^2 T}{3}\right)$$

 n-fold vortex (Φ=nhc/2e) in FFLO paired state: get n chiral Majorana modes in the vortex core.

$$\epsilon_p(k_z) = \epsilon_F \left(1 - \frac{2p}{n+1} \right) + v_F k_z. \qquad p = 1, \dots, n.$$



 Any even number 2n of Majorana vortex modes may be combined into n ID Weyl fermion modes, which are gapped out by pairing:



 Any even number 2n of Majorana vortex modes may be combined into n ID Weyl fermion modes, which are gapped out by pairing:

$$H = v_F \sum_{k_z} [k_z c_{k_z}^{\dagger} \tau^z c_{k_z} + \Delta (c_{k_z}^{\dagger} i \tau^y c_{-k_z}^{\dagger} + \text{h.c.})/2]$$

An odd number of Majorana modes can not be eliminated without breaking translational symmetry, thus a fundamental SC vortex may not be condensed.

$$\Phi = \frac{hc}{2e} = \pi \qquad \qquad \hbar = c = e = 1$$

 A double vortex does not have Majorana modes, but may still not be condensed.

 This follows from the fact that the insulating state we want to obtain must preserve the chiral anomaly, i.e. must have a Hall conductivity of half conductivity quantum per atomic plane:

$$\sigma_{xy} = \frac{1}{2\pi} \frac{2Q}{2\pi} = \frac{1}{4\pi}$$

A vortex will induce a charge when intersecting an atomic plane:

$$\mathcal{L} = \frac{\sigma_{xy}}{2} \epsilon^{\mu\nu\lambda} A_{\mu} \partial_{\nu} A_{\lambda}$$
$$n = \frac{\Phi}{4\pi} = \frac{1}{2}$$

 Since vortex is a loop, it will always intersect any atomic plane twice, inducing a pair of opposite charges, whose effect will thus cancel.

But consider a crystal with a dislocation.



In this case vortex loop may intersect the extra halfplane only once, inducing uncompensated 1/2 charge.

 In this case vortex loop may intersect the extra halfplane only once, inducing uncompensated 1/2 charge.



Wang & Levin 3-loop braiding

• Two such charges will have semion exchange statistics:

$$\theta = 2\pi^2 \sigma_{xy} = \frac{\pi}{2}$$



- Two such charges will have semion exchange statistics.
- This means that, inserting a dislocation in a crystal with condensed vortices will cost an energy $O(L^2)$
 - This implies broken translational symmetry.

 Following the same logic, quadruple vortices have bosonic statistics and thus may be condensed without breaking any symmetries.

This is an insulating state that preserves the chiral anomaly and does not break any symmetries.

$$\sigma_{xy} = \frac{1}{2\pi} \frac{2Q}{2\pi} = \frac{1}{4\pi} \qquad \kappa_{xy} = \sigma_{xy} \left(\frac{\pi^2 k_B^2 T}{3}\right) = \frac{1}{4\pi} \left(\frac{\pi^2 k_B^2 T}{3}\right)$$
Nontrivial generalization of FQHE to 3D



 In the presence of interactions, smooth evolution of the Hall conductivity with the magnetization in a Weyl semimetal may be interrupted by a half-quantized plateau.

Conclusions

- Both insulators and metals may be topological.
- Topological metal is a metal, whose Fermi surface breaks up into disconnected sheets, each enclosing a "magnetic monopole in momentum space", or Weyl node.
- These nodes are topological objects and lead to observable phenomena: Fermi arc surface states, giant anisotropic magnetoresistance and dissipationless transport, non-Drude optical conductivity, 3D fractional quantum Hall effect, etc.