# Non-equilibrium QCD in Heavy-Ion Collisions

Sören Schlichting | Universität Bielefeld

Reviews:

*SS, Teaney, Ann.Rev.Nucl.Part.Sci.* 69 (2019) 447-476 Berges, Heller, Mazeliauskas, Venugopalan arXiv:*2005.12299* 

Theoretical Physics Colloquium @ ASU

Phoenix, AZ, Sept 2020





UNIVERSITÄT

BIELEFELD

#### Overview





Basics of weak coupling thermalization in QCD plasmas



Early time dynamics & entropy production in high-energy Heavy-Ion Collisions



Conclusions & Outlook



## Introduction & Motivation

## High energy Heavy-Ion Collisions

Science goal is to explore the structure and dynamics of the fundamental constituents of matter

-> described by theory of strong interactions of quarks & gluons (QCD)

However under normal conditions, quarks & gluons confined in color neutral bounds states (p,n, $\pi$ ,K,...)

-> need extreme conditions (high resolution, high temperature) to "see" fundamental constituents

Explored in high-energy Heavy-Ion collisions experiments at RHIC (BNL) and LHC (CERN) as well as GSI/FAIR and NICA (Dubna)

Extraction of QCD properties from heavy-ion experiments requires profound understanding of the space-time dynamics of the collision





## Dynamics of HICs

Dynamical description of heavy-ion collisions from underlying theory of QCD remains an outstanding challenge

Standard model of nucleus-nucleus (A+A) collisions based on macroscopic description of the space-time dynamics of the QGP



Space-time dynamics of HICs dominated by near-equilibrium hydrodynamic expansion

Extremely successful phenomenology based on hydrodynamic models with parametrized initial state ~ 1 fm/c Small effects of pre-equilibrium dynamics on typical observables  $(v_n, <p_T>,...)$ 

Theoretical description of pre-equilibrium dynamics highly desirable

## Equilibration of QCD plasmas

#### High-Energy Heavy-Ion Collisions:

How does macroscopic description as viscous fluid (macrosccopic variables e,u<sup>µ</sup>) emerge from non-equilibrium dynamics of "primordial" far-from equilibrium plasma created in the collision?

#### Early Universe:

How is Standard Model Matter produced and equilibrated between end of Inflation and BBN?







# Basics of weak coupling thermalization in QCD plasmas

#### Non-equilibrium QCD

Generally there is no exact way to study non-equilibrium dynamics in an interacting quantum field theory

In high-energy QCD first principles studies are feasible in two limits

#### Weak coupling limit of QCD

Description in terms of the fundamental degrees and freedom (quarks & gluons) based on kinetic theory/classical-statistical simulations

#### Strong coupling limit ( $g^2Nc >> 1$ ) of related theories

Description based on holographic methods for strongly coupled gauge theories (N=4 SYM)

Will use weak-coupling description based on (LO) QCD kinetic theory  $(\alpha_s <<1)$  to describe dynamics of non-equilibrium QCD plasmas

-> Extrapolate findings to realistic coupling strength ( $\alpha_s \sim 0.3$ ) when addressing HICs

### Non-equilibrium QCD

#### Effective kinetic theory of QCD at LO\*

Arnold, Moore, Yaffe JHEP 0301 (2003) 030

$$p^{\mu}\partial_{\mu}f(x,p) = \mathcal{C}_{2\leftrightarrow 2}[f] + C_{1\leftrightarrow 2}[f]$$

#### Characteristic features:

- ultra-relativistic massless quasi-particles (g,u,ubar,d,dbar,s,sbar)
- elastic (2<->2) & in-elastic (1<->2) proccesses at the same order



Solve numerically as integro-differential equation, with in-medium matrix elements for 2<->2 and 1<->2 processes self-consistently determined

\*Note that expansion is in g rather than  $\alpha_s = g^2/4\pi$ 

#### Basics of weak-coupling thermalization

Before addressing the complex problem of thermalization in HICs it is interesting to start with thermalization of homogenous & isotropic QCD plasmas

Kurkela, Moore JHEP 12 (2011) 044

If we focus on initial states from from-equilibrium can distinguish two qualitiatively different cases

Over-occupied QCD plasma

Under-occupied QCD plasma



Energy carried by large number of low energy dof's << T (e.g. due to instabilities)



Energy carried by small number of high energy dof's >> T (e.g. high-energy jets)

#### Over-occupied QCD plasmas

Enhanced scattering rates at early times lead to effective memory loss even before system thermalizes



X. Du, SS, in preparation

## Self-similar evolution of gluon distribution $f_G(t,p)$ associated with energy transport to UV

SS Phys.Rev.D 86 (2012); Abrao York, Kurkela, Lu, Moore *Phys.Rev.D* 89 (2014) 7 Berges, Boguslavski, SS, Venugopalan *Phys.Rev.D* 89 (2014) 11; Berges, Mazeliauskas Phys.Rev.Lett. 122 (2019)

## Quarks are sub-dominant and simply follow gluon distribution

$$f_g(t,p) = t^{\alpha} f_g^S(t^{\beta} p)$$

 $f_q(t,p) = f_q^S(t^\beta p)$  (11)

## Over-occupied QCD plasmas

Self-similar scaling behavior associated with energy transport towards UV is anologous to direct energy cascade in decaying turbulence







Same scaling behavior persist even for moderately large values of the coupling constant until energy transfer to the UV is complete and the system thermalizes

X. Du, SS, in preparation

$$\alpha = -4/7 \quad \beta = -1/7$$

#### Over-occupied QCD plasmas



#### Thermalization time

Kurkela, Lu Phys.Rev.Lett. 113 (2014) 18 SS, Teaney Ann.Rev.Nucl.Part.Sci. 69 (2019)

 $t_{\rm thermal} \sim \alpha_s^{-2} f_0^{-1/4} Q^{-1} \sim \alpha_s^{-2} T^{-1}$ 

Non-perturbative classical-statistical simulations give same picture but are unable to describe approach to equilibrium

Berges, Boguslavski, SS, Venugopalan *Phys.Rev.D* 89 (2014) 11; Mace, SS, Venugopalan *Phys.Rev.D* 93 (2016) 7; Berges, Mace SS Phys.Rev.Lett. 118 (2017) 19

#### Same kind of thermalization pattern emerges in a variety of far-fromequilibrium systems incl. relativistic and non-relativistic Bose gases

Micha, Tkachev *Phys.Rev.D* 70 (2004) 043538; Berges, Boguslavski, SS Venugoplan *Phys.Rev.Lett.* 114 (2015) 6, 061601; Berges, Heller, Mazeliauskas, Venugopalan arXiv:2005.12299

## Under-occupied QCD plasmas

Even for relatively small scale separation evolution shows characteristic features of "bottom-up" thermalization

Baier et al. Phys.Lett.B 502 (2001)



Hard particles emit soft quark/gluon radiation

X. Du, SS, in preparation

Soft quarks/gluons thermalize and form a thermal bath with low temperature

Inverse energy cascade deposits energy of hard particles into soft-thermal bath

## Under-occupied QCD plasmas

Inverse energy cascade associated with scale invariant energy flux from hard sector ~Q to soft sector ~T

Standard features of weak wave turbulence observed for sufficiently large scale separatio (e.g. high-energy Jet in thermal medium)

#### Kolmogorov spectrum $f_{g/q}(T << p << Q) \sim p^{-7/2}$

Baier et al. Phys.Lett.B 502 (2001),; Blaizot, Iancu, Mehtar-Tani *Phys.Rev.Lett.* 111 (2013) 052001; Mehtar-Tani, SS *JHEP* 09 (2018) 144

Chemistry f<sub>Q</sub>(T<<p<<Q) /f<sub>g</sub>(T<<p<<Q) determined by balance of g->qqbar and q->qg processes

Mehtar-Tani, SS JHEP 09 (2018) 144 I. Soudi, SS, arXiv:2008.04928



#### Under-occupied QCD plasmas



"Bottom-up" thermalization is delayed due to reduced splitting rates of high-momentum particles  $\Gamma_{inel}(Q) \sim (T/Q)^{1/2} \Gamma_{eq}$ 

## Expanding systems created in HICs

Non-equilibrium QCD plasma created immediately after the collision of heavy nuclei is subject to a rapid longitudinal expansion



Since particles with large  $p_{long}$  escape quickly central region, the central QGP will be highly anistotropic with  $p_T >> p_{long}$  and becomes increasingly dilute

Generally interested in evolution over short time scales  $\tau \sim 1$ fm/c << R<sub>A</sub> where transverse expansion of QGP (~1/R) can be neglected

Describe non-eq. QGP locally as approximately homogenous in transverse plane and invariant under long. boosts

Energy momentum tensor assumes average form  $T^{\mu\nu} = \text{diag}(e, p_T, p_T, p_L)$  with  $p_L << p_T$  at early times

#### Microscopic evolution

#### Evolution of homogenous boost invariant system in QCD kinetic theory

Kurkela, Zhu PRL 115 (2015) 182301; Keegan, Kurkela, Mazeliauskas, Teaney JHEP 1608 (2016) 171; Kurkela, Mazeliauskas, Paquet, SS, Teaney PRL 122 (2019) no.12, 122302; PRC 99 (2019) no.3, 034910



Eventually equilibration of expanding QCD plasma proceeds a la ``bottom-up" via radiative break-up

#### Hydrodynamic behavior

Hydrodynamics describes the macroscopic evolution of energy-momentum tensor T<sup>µv</sup> based on an expansion around local thermal equilibrium

$$Kn \sim \lambda_{micro}/L_{macro}$$
  $Re^{-1} \sim \delta T_{dissipative}^{\mu\nu}/T_{eq}^{\mu\nu}$ 

Since the system is highly anisotropic at early times ( $P_L << P_T$ ), key question is to understand evolution of  $T^{\mu\nu}$  towards local equilibrium ( $P_L = P_T$ )



Equilibration process controlled by a single equilibrium relaxation rate

$$\tau_R^{\rm eq}(\tau) = \frac{4\pi\eta/s}{T_{\rm eff}(\tau)}$$

Simulations at different coupling ( $\lambda$ =5-20) strength indicate small sensitivity to  $\alpha_s$  when compared in units of  $\tau_R^{eq}$ 

Kurkela, Zhu PRL 115 (2015) 182301 Kurkela, Mazeliauskas, Paquet, SS, Teaney 1805.01604; 1805.00961

#### Hydrodynamic behavior

Effective description in viscous hydrodynamics becomes applicable on time scales

$$au_{
m hydro} \approx au_R^{
m eq}( au) \qquad au_R^{
m eq}( au) = rac{4\pi\eta/s}{T_{
m eff}( au)} \qquad au_{
m hydro}$$

$$au_{
m hydro} pprox 1.1 \, {
m fm} \, \left( rac{4\pi (\eta/s)}{2} 
ight)^{rac{3}{2}} \left( rac{\langle \tau s 
angle}{4.1 \, {
m GeV}^2} 
ight)^{-1/2}$$

in line with earlier phenomenological estimates

Kurkela, Zhu PRL 115 (2015) 182301 Kurkela, Mazeliauskas, Paquet, SS, Teaney 1805.01604; 1805.00961



Viscous hydrodynamics becomes applicable when

$$Kn \sim \tau_R^{eq}(\tau)/\tau \sim 1$$
$$Re^{-1} \sim 1 - T^{\mu\nu}/T_{\rm Bjorken}^{\mu\nu} \sim 1$$

Surprising effectiveness of viscous fluid dynamics also found e.g. at strong coupling

Heller, Janik, Witaszczyk PRL 108 (2012) 201602 Romatschke PRL 120 (2018) no.1, 012301

. . .

## Dynamics of HICs

Based on progress in understanding early time dynamics & equilibration can now describe HIC from beginning to end by matching different effective descriptions of QCD

Kurkela, Mazeliauskas, Paquet, SS, Teaney PRL 122 (2019) no.12, 122302; PRC 99 (2019) no.3, 034910

Effects of including pre-equilibrium dynamics on experimental observables generally small



Controlled extraction of QGP transport properties without large uncertainties from early times

Difficult to gain experimental access to early time non-equilibrium dynamics in A+A collisions



# Early time dynamics & entropy production in HIC

3

## Sensitivity to Initial state

Entropy production occurs only when system is significantly out-of-equilibrium



Entropy production in HICs is dominated by early time dynamics and directly accessible by measurement of  $dN_{ch}/d\eta$ 

Schematically:

(nearly) isentropic expansion



Based on insights from non-equilibrium studies, can now make relation between dE/dη and dN<sub>ch</sub>/dη explicit

## Early time dynamics & entropy production

Non-equilibrium initial state better characterized in terms of energy density (e), better to use entropy density (s) only once system is close to equilibrium

Energy momentum tensor assumes average form  $T^{\mu\nu} = \text{diag}(e, p_T, p_T, p_L)$ 

Evolution of energy density is governed by conservation equation

$$\partial_{\tau}\epsilon = -\frac{\epsilon}{\tau} - \frac{P_L}{\tau}$$

need equation of state/constitutive relation  $P_L(e,\tau)$  to obtain evolution

Generally no constitutive equations out-of-equilibrium and  $P_L/e$  depends on microscopics

#### Hydrodynamic attractors



Non-equilibrium evolution towards hydrodynamics described by "hydrodynamic attractor"

Heller, Spalinski PRL 115 (2015) no.7, 072501

Effective constitutive relations for far-from-equilibrium systems

$$\frac{P_L}{\epsilon} = f(\epsilon, \tau) = f\left(\tilde{w} = \frac{T(\tau)\tau}{4\pi\eta/s}\right)$$

Despite clear microscopic differences the macroscopic features of the evolution are remarkably similar when compared in meaningful fashion

# Universality at early times (free-streaming) & late times (visc. hydrodynamics)

Romatschke *Phys.Rev.Lett.* 120 (2018) 1, 012301; Giacalone, Mazeliauskas, SS PRL 123 (2019) 26, 262301 Kurkela, Schee, Wiedemann, Wu *Phys.Rev.Lett.* 124 (2020) 10, 102301

## Entropy production in HICs

Effective constitutive equation allows to obtain evolution of energy density from

$$e(\tilde{w}_{\tau}) = e(\tilde{w}_0) \exp\left(-\int_{\tilde{w}_0}^{\tilde{w}_{\tau}} \frac{d\tilde{w}}{\tilde{w}} \frac{1 + P_L(\tilde{w})/e(\tilde{w})}{\frac{3}{4} - \frac{1}{4}P_L(\tilde{w})/e(\tilde{w})}\right)$$

Once QGP is close to equilibrium can use thermodynamic relations s=(e+p)/T and EOS once QGP to calculate entropy

$$(s\tau)_{\rm hydro} = \frac{4}{3} C_{\infty}^{3/4} \left(4\pi \frac{\eta}{s}\right)^{1/3} \left(\frac{\pi^2}{30} \nu_{\rm eff}\right)^{1/3} (e\tau)_0^{2/3}.$$



Since overall entropy is approx. conserved during hydro expansion charged particle multiplicity at freeze-out directly determined

$$rac{dN_{
m ch}}{d\eta}pprox A_{\perp} \; (s au)_{
m hydro} rac{N_{
m ch}}{S}$$

Giacalone, Mazeliauskas, SS PRL 123 (2019) 26, 262301

## Entropy production in HICs

Based on macroscopic considerations one can establish one-to-one correspondence between initial state energy density and charged particle multiplicity including all relevant pre-factors

$$\frac{dN_{\rm ch}}{d\eta} \approx \frac{4}{3} \left(\frac{N_{\rm ch}}{S}\right) A_{\perp} C_{\infty}^{3/4} \left(4\pi \frac{\eta}{s}\right)^{1/3} \left(\frac{\pi^2}{30} \nu_{\rm eff}\right)^{1/3} (\epsilon\tau)_0^{2/3}$$

#### Sensitivities/Uncertainties:

Equilibrium properties: N<sub>ch</sub>/S~7.5, v<sub>eff</sub> ~40 approximately known

#### Non-equilibrium/transport properties:

 $C_{\infty} \sim 0.95 \pm 0.15$  surprisingly well constraint  $4\pi \eta/s \sim (1-3)$  not well constraint in relevant temperature range (T $\sim 4T_c$ )

#### Initial state energy density:

(eτ)<sub>0</sub> significant uncertainties from small-x TMDs and perturbative corrections

#### Initial state in HICs

Extraction of initial state energy dE/dŋ from final measured multiplicity



Sensitivity to  $\eta$ /s and  $(e\tau)_0$  can be exploited to obtain combined constraints on initial state & transport properties

## Conclusions & Outlook

3

Significant progress in understanding non-equilibrium QCD dynamics wrt onset of hydrodynamic behavior & equilibration of QGP

- Established thermalization of patterns of QCD(-like) plasmas
- Viscous hydrodynamics != local thermal equilibrium
- -> Implications for non-equilibrium plasmas in early universe?

Studies have reached a level where they can connect properties of initial state with experimental measurements and useful phenomenological results can be obtained

# KoMPoST: Eff. macroscopic description of non-Eq QCD in heavy-ion collisions including transverse dynamics

Kurkela, Mazeliauskas, Paquet, SS, Teaney PRL 122 (2019) no.12, 122302; PRC 99 (2019) no.3, 034910

Establishing link between initial state and finale state important to connect Heavy-Ion Physics to Physics at EIC & Hadron Colliders

Small-x gluon (G)TMDs determine initial state energy density in A+A as well as (forward) di-jet production in p+p/A or e+p/A

So far investigations have mostly focused on bulk equilibration in A+A collisions Electro-magnetic & hard probes, small systems (p+p/A), nonequilibrium effects in jet-medium interactions provide promising avenues to further explore non-equilibrium QCD in heavy-ion collisions (30)

## Backup

#### Non-equilibrium towards hydrodynamics

Evolution of homogenous boost invariant system in Boltzmann RTA M. Strickland JHEP 1812 (2018) 128

$$p^{\mu}\partial_{\mu}f(x,p) = -\frac{p^{\mu}u_{\mu}(x)}{\tau_R(x)} \Big[f(x,p) - f_{\rm eq}(x,p)\Big]$$



## Small systems (p/d/He3+p/A)

Shorter life-time of the system (~R) increases sensitivity to initial state and non-equilibrium dynamics



Event multiplicity ( $dN_{ch}/d\eta$ )

Some additional control parameters ( $p_T$ ,...) besides multiplicity  $dN_{ch}/d\eta$ 



#### 34

## Hydrodynamic QGP in small systems?

Non-equilibrium dynamics of QGP controlled by the ratio of hydrodynamization time ( $\tau_{Hydro}$ ) and system size (R)

THydro >> R: insufficient time to achieve equilibrated QGP

THydro << R: long lived hydrodynamic QGP phase

Based on estimates of the hydrodynamization time critical multiplicity can be estimated

Experimental results in small systems mostly fall into the regime  $\tau_{Hydro}/R \sim 1$  dominated by non-equilibrium phase

$$\frac{\tau_{\text{Hydro}}}{R} \simeq \left(\frac{4\pi(\eta/s)}{2}\right)^{\frac{3}{2}} \left(\frac{dN_{\text{ch}}/d\eta}{63}\right)^{-\frac{1}{2}} \quad <=> \quad \frac{dN_{\text{ch}}}{d\eta}\Big|_{\text{crit}} = 63 \left(\frac{\eta/s}{2/4\pi}\right)^{3} \left(\frac{\tau_{\text{Hydro}}}{R}\right)^{-2}$$
where  $\left.\frac{dN_{ch}}{d\eta}\right|_{\min,\ bias}^{p+p\ 7TeV} \sim 6$ ,  $\left.\frac{dN_{ch}}{d\eta}\right|_{\min,\ bias}^{p+Pb\ 5.02TeV} \sim 16$ ,  $\left.\frac{dN_{ch}}{d\eta}\right|_{0-5\%}^{Pb+Pb\ 2.76TeV} \sim 1600$ 



R

## Pre-flow $(T^{\tau i})$ & Viscous corrections $(T^{ij})$

#### Gradients in $x_T$ induce off-diagonal components of $T^{\mu\nu}$

# Universal pre-flow: early expansion of matter insensitive to microscopic details

Pratt, Vredevoogd PRC79 (2009) 044915 Kurkela, Mazeliauskas, Paquet, SS, Teaney PRC 99 (2019) no.3, 034910

 $\frac{T^{\tau i}(\tau, \mathbf{x})}{T^{\tau \tau}(\tau, \mathbf{x})} \approx -\frac{(\tau - \tau_0)}{2} \frac{\partial^i T^{\tau \tau}(\tau_0, \mathbf{x})}{T^{\tau \tau}(\tau, \mathbf{x})}$ 

not indicative of onset of hydrodynamic flow

Viscous corrections: long wavelength components satisfy hydrodynamic constitutive equations approximately at  $\tau = \tau_{Hydro}$ 

 $\pi^{\mu\nu}(\tau_{\rm Hydro}, \mathbf{x}) \approx \pi_{\rm NS}^{\mu\nu}$ 



Pre-flow package KoMPoST provide unified description of preequilibrium evolution of T<sup>µv</sup> based on linear response to gradients

#### KoMPoST

Macroscopic description of pre-equilibrium dynamics

Exploit memory loss to use macroscopic degrees of freedom T<sup>µv</sup> for description of pre-equilibrium dynamics

Separation of scales between evolution time  $\tau_{Hydro}$  and typical size scale of gradients  $R_A$ 

Decomposing  $T^{\mu\nu}(x)$  into a local average  $T^{\mu\nu}_{BG}(x)$  and fluctuations  $\delta T^{\mu\nu}(x)$ , are small on scales  $c(\tau_{Hydro}-\tau_0)$ , they can be treated in linear response theory

Keegan, Kurkela, Mazeliauskas, Teaney JHEP 1608 (2016) 171 Kurkela, Mazeliauskas, Paquet, SS, Teaney arXiv:1805.01604; arXiv:1805.00961



Initial state

#### Non-equilibrium linear response

Energy-momentum tensor at τ<sub>Hydro</sub> can be reconstructed directly from initial conditions



$$T^{\mu\nu}(\tau, x) = T^{\mu\nu}_{BG}(\tau) + \int_{\bigodot} G^{\mu\nu}_{\alpha\beta}(\tau, \tau_0, x, x_0) \delta T^{\alpha\beta}(\tau_0, x_0)$$

non-equilibrium evolution of (local) average background non-equilibrium Greens function of energy-momentum tensor

Instead of event-by-event Monte-Carlo, effective kinetic theory simulations performed only once to compute evolution of background  $T^{\mu\nu}{}_{BG}$  and Greens functions  $G^{\mu\nu}{}_{\alpha\beta}$ 



## Longitudinal dynamics (η)

Boost invariance ( $\eta \sim 0$ ) on average is reasonable assumption for symmetric high-energy collisions

Different models for long. fluctuations based on different degrees of freedom partons ,nucleons, strings, ...

High-energy: Energy deposition at different  $\eta \sim y$  simultaneous probes gluon distribution at different x



SS Schenke PRC 94 (2016) no.4, 044907, McDonald, Jeon, NPA 982 (2019) 239-242, Ipp, Mueller PLB 771 (2017) 74-79

# Space-time dynamics of baryon stopping at forward rapidities can also be addressed within small-x framework

McLerran, SS, Sen PRD99 (2019) no.7, 074009